

## National Council for Science and the Environment



# ENERGY PROGRAMS IN HIGHER EDUCATION IN THE UNITED STATES:

ASSESSING TRENDS ACROSS TWO PATHWAYS TO KNOWLEDGE DEVELOPMENT

**NOVEMBER 2018** 



# National Council for Science and the Environment

# ENERGY PROGRAMS IN HIGHER EDUCATION IN THE UNITED STATES:

# ASSESSING TRENDS ACROSS TWO PATHWAYS TO KNOWLEDGE DEVELOPMENT

**NOVEMBER 2018** 

#### By

Valerie A. Luzadis, PhD, NCSE Board of Directors;
State University of New York College of Environmental Science and Forestry
Paul D. Hirsch, PhD, NCSE Senior Research Fellow;
State University of New York College of Environmental Science and Forestry
Xiao Huang, 2017-2018 NCSE Intern;
Harvard University

#### **Acknowledgements**

We would like to acknowledge Dr. Jennie C. Stephens, Director of the School of Public Policy and Urban Affairs, Northeastern University & Dr. Tom L. Richard, Director of Penn State Institutes for Energy and the Environment, Penn State University. Drs. Stephens and Richard are co-chairs of the NCSE Energy Education Community of Practice, and we are grateful to them for providing context for the interpretation of the data within energy education programming. We would also like to acknowledge Dr. Erica Goldman, Science Policy Director for the National Council for Science and the Environment, for providing comments and feedback on early drafts of the report.

#### This document may be cited as:

Luzadis, V.A., P.D. Hirsch, and X. Huang. 2018. *Energy Programs in Higher Education in the United States:* Assessing Trends Across Two Pathways To Knowledge Development. National Council for Science and the Environment: Washington, DC.



#### National Council for Science and the Environment

Established in 1990, the National Council for Science and the Environment (NCSE) is a not-for-profit organization that works to improve the scientific basis for environmental decision-making. NCSE specializes in programs that foster collaboration between the diverse institutions and individuals creating and using environmental and sustainability knowledge; including research, education, environmental, and business organizations, as well as all levels of government. NCSE works collectively with its community to strengthen the role and use of science and higher education in policy.

NCSE brings together individuals, institutions, and communities to advance environmental and sustainability science and education, working across three strategic areas:

- · Research and Education
- Leadership and Community
- Policy and Decision-making

#### **NCSE Community**

The backbone of NCSE's programmatic work is its institutional members—four-year and two-year colleges and universities that work collectively with NCSE to advance meaningful connections between science, education, and policy.

The NCSE University Affiliate Program engages universities and colleges across the country to provide them with new research and resources; create forums for inter-institutional collaborations to advance their professional, program, and institutional goals; and connect them with a broader community of researchers, funding organizations, and decision-makers. NCSE's University Affiliates are dedicated to advancing the field of inter-disciplinary environmental and sustainability higher education and its role in environmental policy and decision-making.

As an exclusive benefit, NCSE's University Affiliate members receive complimentary access to the NCSE research data and report series. The research tracks trends in the evolving fields of interdisciplinary environmental, sustainability, and energy higher education through analysis of the scope, defining characteristics, administrative structures, and design of academic and research programs at US colleges and universities.

## Table of Contents

ABOUT NCSE	3
Overview	5
Introduction	6
Methodology and Data	8
Results	9
Limitations	
Discussion	
Literature Cited	20
Appendix	21-49



## Overview

Across all levels of higher education, boundary-spanning majors, minors, departments, centers, and certificates are proliferating and attracting greater numbers of students. Such programmatic developments are among the ways in which higher education evolves and adapts to changing societal demands. The evolution of the field of energy education is indicative of this larger process in which long-standing disciplinary structures are blurred and bridged, and new inter- and transdisciplinary programs emerge. This process is epitomized in particular by the recent growth of degree programs oriented to the development of and transition to forms of energy that are affordable, accessible, clean, and sustainable.

Whether one's primary concern is national security, economic progress, or environmental sustainability, the boundary spanning development of knowledge focused on solutions to our energy challenges, and of qualified graduates who possess that knowledge, is essential. But what sorts of knowledge are required, and what sorts of educational programming and institutional structures will best support its development? More specifically, what is the appropriate mix between energy-oriented education that fosters the scientific knowhow that is a prerequisite for technological innovation, and energy-oriented education that fosters the holistic consideration of complex interconnections that is a prerequisite for informed decision-making?

While the drivers of evolution within the higher education landscape include a combination of forces – students' demands, professors' inspirations, administrators' constraints, funders' visions, employers' needs and labor markets – it is also possible that the processes through which institutions develop programs that meet their own needs may result in a deficit in aggregate and at the national level. In this report, we seek to provide a foundation for addressing these questions and concerns. To do so, we draw on the results of a recent census conducted by the National Council for Science and the Environment to characterize trends in energy-oriented programming in higher education in terms of two pathways to knowledge development, one focused on technological innovation and the other on complex decision making.



## Introduction



FINDING SOLUTIONS
TO ENERGY-RELATED
PROBLEMS REQUIRES
THE DEVELOPMENT
OF KNOWLEDGE
ACROSS THE
NATURAL AND
SOCIAL SCIENCES
AS WELL AS
ENGINEERING AND
OTHER TECHNICAL
DISCIPLINES.

In September of 2017, the National Council for Science and the Environment (NCSE) reported on the results of a 2016 census of interdisciplinary environmental, sustainability, and energy-oriented (IESE) programming in higher education in the United States (Vincent et al. 2017). The results of the census, when compared to the previous NCSE census conducted in 2012 (Vincent et al. 2012), indicate a significant expansion in the number of IESE degrees offered over that four-year period, as well as an increase in the number of institutions offering IESE related programming.

Within the broader domain of IESE programming in the US, although the overall number of programs focused on energy remains low, energy-related programming represents an area of significant growth. Energy-oriented degree pro-

grams showed the second highest levels of growth (62 percent) for all degree program types. Indeed, if we leave aside degree programs oriented to the broad category of sustainability (which grew by 89 percent) and focus on those degree programs oriented to a substantive domain within sustainability, energy programming showed the highest levels of growth, ahead of degree programs in coastal and marine systems (33 percent growth) and in water resources/watershed management (16 percent growth) (Vincent et al. 2017).

Finding solutions to energy-related problems requires the development of knowledge across the natural and social sciences as well as engineering and other technical disciplines. No single degree program can provide both the breadth and depth of knowledge that is required. While different pathways of knowledge development can be complementary, they may not necessarily be compatible within the same academic program (or within the same individual mind, for that matter). Cultivation of knowledge related to current energy challenges thus calls for a balance between pathways that drill down into the technical specifics of renewable forms of energy on the one hand, and, on the other, pathways that train students to think across the ethical, social, political and economic dimensions of issues in ways that are necessary to inform and facilitate difficult decisions.

In an article in the 2010 edition of the Oxford Handbook of Interdisciplinarity, scholar Daniel Sarewitz, who directs the Consortium for Science, Policy, and Outcomes at Arizona State University, contrasts two alternative

pathways of knowledge development. Path 1 entails the development of reductive knowledge intended to lead to innovation and technological development. Path 2 entails the development of holistic knowledge intended to lead to better decision making. While Path 1 is an essential source of societal development and transformation, Path 2 becomes necessary precisely because of the unanticipated consequences of technological development along Path 1.

"[The] context independence of science allows reductionist knowledge to be embodied in engineered artifacts that themselves behave predictably, regardless of context. Holistic scientific inquiry, in stark contrast, strives for insight that embraces and explains context and complexity, that enhances comprehension of human and natural systems—the very systems that are continually being rendered more complex and incomprehensible due to the technological fruits of reductionist inquiry." (Sarewitz 2010, page 68).

Sarewitz expresses skepticism as to the ability of Path 2 forms of inquiry to live up to our expectations. While Path 1 knowledge development has given us the wonders and benefits of travel to far places at high speeds, he points out, Path 2 has yet to meaningfully address the negative implications of these technological advances, such as the accumulation of atmospheric greenhouse gases that results from their use. As he sees it, the degree of complexity that holistic inquiry must embrace – from individual behavior to geopolitical maneuvering – mitigates against its effectiveness in moving the lever for our most serious socio-technical challenges. While Sarewitz does not directly address the field of energy education, one might infer that he would caution against an overemphasis on Path 2 forms of knowledge development at the expense of adequate investment in the technical capacities fostered along Path 1, such as those pertaining to wind and solar energy, for example, or energy-efficient agriculture and building methods.

By contrast, David Blockstein, the first Executive Director of the National Council for Science and the Environment, along with his co-authors in a 2015 article in the *Journal of Sustainability Education*, makes a strong case for the importance of holistic inquiry in energy education. Although the article does not make Sarewitz's distinction, the authors clearly advocate for the importance of Path 2 knowledge development across the energy education landscape. After observing critically that education relevant to the energy industries has been siloed within the natural and physical sciences and engineering, the authors argue for the need for a new integrative academic field of "energy studies."

"The practical study of energy in academia today is really the study of components of the energy industries. A graduate knows how to make the machines of his or her specialty work, and he or she may know the basics of production costs and sales prices of the energy produced by their particular industry. They are less likely to know about the environmental, political, economic and ethical contexts surrounding their industries. Many have never considered questions of equity and social justice that connect to decisions about new energy. Similarly they probably have little experience analyzing alternative energy choices." (Blockstein et al. 2015, page 2).

While Sarewitz and Blockstein express contrasting concerns, our aim here is to use them to illuminate an understanding of the energy program data we present here. There is certainly both room and need within the energy education landscape for programs that lead students along Path 1 and Path 2, as well as those that attempt to be inclusive of both. Distinguishing between these two pathways, and assessing the current landscape through the lens and context of this distinction, allows for a critical and strategic look at the field and can inform continuing efforts to invest in educational programming that meets society's changing needs.

## Methodology and Data

To assess the trends in pathways in energy education and explore synergies and different foci, we used data generated by two recent censuses conducted by NCSE of US baccalaureate and graduate programs, one conducted in 2012 and one in 2016. Both sought to comprehensively characterize the scope of baccalaureate and graduate degree programs in environment, sustainability, natural resources, energy and other interdisciplinary programs focused on the environment (such as marine sciences, earth systems science and water resources and watershed management). Also included were disciplinary degrees and degrees in professional fields with formal IESE specializations, as well as certificate and minor programs. Full results of the censuses are available to NCSE institutional members (contact NCSE for these reports).

Each census was conducted by reviewing the websites and online catalogs of all four-year colleges using the comprehensive Carnegie Classification List. In 2012, the website and catalogs of 1,602 four-year colleges were reviewed, and in 2016 this number increased to 1,690 (see Appendix, Table A, for a breakdown of the different types of Carnegie Classified Institutions reviewed, including the total number of doctoral institutions, tribal colleges, etc.).



Each census identified a subset of IESE programs focused on energy. Specifically, the censuses sought to identify and characterize "non-traditional broad energy" (NTBE) academic programs. Non-traditional broad energy programs were defined as those that focus on energy sources other than fossil fuels, hydroelectric power and nuclear energy and those that focus on energy broadly. This includes programs focused on renewable and alternative energy, energy and sustainability, energy in the context of business or organizational management, energy efficiency, energy policy and law, and energy public affairs and planning. Not included in the census were programs focused on traditional energy sources or programs that could not be identified by name (such as programs in geosciences or engineering with substantive energy content but without a formal specialization).

Following the overall structure of the censuses, three types of NTBE programs were identified: 1) disciplinary/professional-based degree programs with energy specializations, 2) interdisciplinary/general NTBE energy programs, and 3) energy-oriented minors and certificate programs. The energy related programs were identified by degree and specialization names, not by curricular content. In Tables B-D in the Appendix, these three types of programs identified in the 2016 census are listed by name, institution (and whether it is a public or private non-for-profit university), academic unit, and degree level (bachelors, masters, or doctorate).

In the spring of 2018, preliminary work for the development of a report focused on the energy related programs was passed on to Drs. Valerie Luzadis and Paul Hirsch. Data received by Luzadis and Hirsch included lists of each of the three types of energy programs in the 2016 census (included in the Appendix as Tables B-D), as well as tabular data on numbers of programs coded according to fields and topics. Corresponding data were available

for the 2012 census in a 2013 report published by NCSE that focused on NTBE programming (Vincent et al. 2013). Field/topic categorizations changed slightly between 2012 and 2016 to accommodate new program offerings, for example in Architecture Design and Planning.

In order to parse the data to understand the different trajectories of energy-related programming in higher education, we used the field categorizations as assigned by Vincent's team of census researchers to make a further distinction according to Sarewitz's distinction between Path 1 and Path 2 knowledge development. Field designations categorized as Path 1 and Path 2 are listed below<sup>1</sup>.

**Path 1 Fields /Topics:** Agriculture, Biofuels, Alternative/Renewable Energy, Bioenergy, Biology, Chemistry, Geosciences, Engineering & Technology, Science/Technology, Physics, Wind/Solar/Nuclear Energy

**Path 2 Fields / Topics:** Architecture, Built Environment, Business, Climate, Design & Planning, Economics, Education, Energy and Environment, Environmental Studies/Science, Global Energy, Law, Leadership, Management, Natural Resources, Policy, Public Administration and Affairs, Social Science, Sustainability, Systems

## Results

The 2012 census identified 310 NTBE degree programs: 164 programs in disciplines and professional fields with non-traditional energy specializations, 37 interdisciplinary or general degree programs, and 109 minor and certificate non-traditional energy programs. The 2016 NCSE census identified 460 NTBE degree programs: 211 programs in disciplines and professional fields with non-traditional energy specializations, 57 interdisciplinary or general non-traditional energy academic degree programs, and 192 minor and certificate non-traditional energy programs. Table 1 shows a comparison between the numbers of different types of energy programs in 2012 and 2016, along with the percent increase in each type.

Table 1. Comparison of Energy Programs, 2012 to 2016

	2012	2016	% Increase
Overall # of NTBE Programs Identified	310	460	48%
NTBE programs in disciplines and professional fields	164	211	29%
NTBE interdisciplinary or general degree programs	37	57	54%
NTBE minors and certificates	109	192	76%

The 2016 census identified 460 NTBE degree, minor or certificate programs, of which 268 are degree programs and 192 are minor or certificate programs. Tables 2 – 4 show the breakdowns for numbers of institutions and programs, according to Carnegie Classifications and public or private status.

<sup>1</sup> A few programs were coded as belonging to more than one field and in some cases this resulted in them being counted in both Path 1 and Path 2.

Table 2. Number of NTBE Disciplinary/Professional Degree Programs, According to Carnegie Classifications - 2016 Census

	NTBE Disciplinary/Professional Degree Programs						
	Put	olic	Private		Total		
	Institutions	Programs	Institutions	Programs	Institutions	Programs	
Doctoral Universities - Highest Research Activity	29	70	14	41	43	111	
Doctoral Universities - Higher Research Activity	16	25	8	17	24	42	
Doctoral Universities - Moderate Research Activity	4	4	3	5	7	9	
Master's Colleges and Universities - Large Programs	9	10	4	5	13	15	
Master's Colleges and Universities - Medium Programs	5	7	6	8	11	15	
Master's Colleges and Universities - Smaller Programs	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Baccalaureate Colleges - Arts and Sciences	2	2	3	6	5	8	
Baccalaureate Colleges - Diverse Fields	2	4	4	4	6	8	
Baccalaureate/Associate's Colleges - Mixed	2	2	0	0	2	2	
Special Focus Four-Year			1	1	1	1	
TOTAL	69	124	43	87	112	211	

Table 3. Number of NTBE Interdisciplinary/General Degree Programs, According to Carnegie Classifications - 2016 Census

	NTBE Interdisciplinary/General Degree Programs						
	Put	olic	Private		Total		
	Institutions	Programs	Institutions	Programs	Institutions	Programs	
Doctoral Universities - Highest Research Activity	9	16	10	13	19	29	
Doctoral Universities - Higher Research Activity	6	8	0	0	6	8	
Doctoral Universities - Moderate Research Activity	1	1	0	0	1	1	
Master's Colleges and Universities - Large Programs	8	8	3	3	11	11	
Master's Colleges and Universities - Medium Programs	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Master's Colleges and Universities - Smaller Programs	0	0	2	2	2	2	
Baccalaureate Colleges - Arts and Sciences	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Baccalaureate Colleges - Diverse Fields	2	2	2	3	4	5	
Baccalaureate/Associate's Colleges - Mixed	1	1	0	0	1	1	
Special Focus Four-Year	0	0	0	0	0	0	
TOTAL	27	36	17	21	44	57	

Table 4. Number of NTBE Minors and Certificate Programs, According to Carnegie Classifications - 2016 Census

	NTBE Minors and Certificate Programs						
	Pul	olic	Private		Total		
	Institutions	Programs	Institutions	Programs	Institutions	Programs	
Doctoral Universities - Highest Research Activity	24	49	18	38	42	87	
Doctoral Universities - Higher Research Activity	19	23	8	11	27	34	
Doctoral Universities - Moderate Research Activity	4	6	2	2	6	8	
Master's Colleges and Universities - Large Programs	12	17	7	10	19	27	
Master's Colleges and Universities - Medium Programs	5	7	2	2	7	9	
Master's Colleges and Universities - Smaller Programs	5	8	1	1	6	9	
Baccalaureate Colleges - Arts and Sciences	1	1	3	3	4	4	
Baccalaureate Colleges - Diverse Fields	2	2	3	5	5	7	
Baccalaureate/Associate's Colleges - Mixed	5	5	0	0	5	5	
Special Focus Four-Year	0	0	2	2	2	2	
TOTAL	77	116	46	73	123	192	

Comparisons of Path 1 and Path 2 programs are shown in Table 5, where we further distinguish among NTBE programs according to degree name alignment with Path 1 or Path 2, for both the 2012 and 2016 census data. The data indicate that the number of Path 1 aligned programs has stayed fairly constant between the two time periods - both those that have been classified as Disciplinary/Professional in orientation, and those that have been classified as General/Interdisciplinary. However, there has been a significant increase in Path 2 Energy Programs. Interestingly, the trend for Minors and Certificate programs is the opposite: a significant increase in the numbers with degree names corresponding to Path 1; no significant change in numbers with degree names corresponding to Path 2.

Table 5. NTBE Programs, Path 1 and Path 2 Comparisons

		Discipl Professio Prog		Interdisciplinary/General NTBE Programs		NTBE Minors and Certificate Programs	
		2012	2016	2012	2016	2012	2016
	Path 1 - Science &	89	91	21	19	65	103
	Technology Focus	Not a significant change		Not a significant change		58% Increase	
Path 2 - Decision Focus	Path 2 - Decision Making	69	94	29	48	90	89
	Focus	36% In	ocrease	66% Ir	ncrease	Not a significant change	

Tables 6-8 show the breakdowns of the different categories according to specific field, and according to whether the program was at the bachelors, masters, professional, or doctoral level. Tables 6A and 6B below show field and topic categorizations for the 2012 and 2016 census in disciplinary and professional oriented degree programs with energy specializations. Tables 7A and 7B show field and topic categorizations for the 2012 and 2016 census for interdisciplinary/general NTBE degree programs; and Tables 8A and 8B show field and topic categorizations for the 2012 and 2016 census for minors and certificate programs. Path 1 Fields/Topics are shaded green, while Path 2 Fields/Topics are shaded blue.

Table 6A. Fields and Topics of Disciplinary Degree Programs with Energy Specializations - 2012 Census

Path	Fields/Topics*	Bachelors	Masters	PhD	Total
	Agriculture/Biofuels	5	1	0	6
Path 1	Geosciences	2	1	0	3
	Engineering & Technology	29	37	14	80
Path 1 Totals		36	39	14	89
	Business Administration/ Management	9	9	0	18
Path 2	Environmental Policy/ Management	4	4	0	8
1 4411 2	Environmental Studies, Science, or Systems	13	1	0	14
	Law/Policy/Public Affairs	1	21	3	25
	Sustainability	4	0	0	4
Path 2 Totals		31	35	3	69

<sup>\*</sup> A total of 6 programs were categorized as "other" in the 2012 census and were not included in this analysis.

Table 6B. Fields and Topics of Disciplinary Degree Programs with Energy Specializations - 2016 Census

Path	Fields/Topics	Bachelors	Masters	PhD	Total
	Agriculture	3	0	0	3
	Biology	1	0	0	1
Path 1	Chemistry	3	1	1	5
Path 1	Engineering & Technology	33	29	14	76
	Geosciences	3	2	0	5
	Physics	0	1	0	1
Path 1 Totals		43	33	15	91
	Architecture, Design & Planning	0	2	0	2
	Business/Management/ Economics	13	11	1	25
	Environmental Policy and Management	6	4	2	12
Path 2	Environmental Studies, Science, or Systems	15	2	0	17
	Law, Policy, Public Administration and Affairs	2	26	1	29
	Social Science & Humanities	2	0	0	2
	Sustainability & Derivatives	6	1	0	7
Path 2 Totals		44	46	4	94

Table 7A. Fields and Topics of Interdisciplinary/General NTBE programs - 2012 Census

Path	Fields/Topics	Bachelors	Masters	PhD	Total
Path 1	Alternative/Renewable Energy/ Bioenergy	5	3	1	9
	Science/Technology	7	3	2	12
Path 1 Totals		12	6	3	21
	Energy and Environment	4	3	3	10
	Energy Management	2	1	0	3
Path 2	Energy Policy	4	4	3	11
	Energy and Sustainability	3	0	0	3
	Energy Systems	0	1	1	2
Path 2 Totals		13	9	7	29

Table 7B. Fields and Topics of Interdisciplinary/General NTBE programs - 2016 Census

Path	Fields/Topics	Bachelors	Masters	PhD	Total
	Alternative Energy	1	5	0	6
Path 1	Engineering and Technology	5	4	3	12
	Geoscience	1	0	0	1
Path 1 Totals		7	9	3	19
	Design and Planning	1	1	0	2
	Energy Management	8	2	0	10
Path 2	Energy Policy	6	5	3	14
	Energy and Sustainability	7	4	0	11
	Energy Systems	1	3	2	6
	Global Energy	1	0	0	1
Path 2 Totals		24	15	5	44

Table 8A. Fields and Topics of Energy Minors and Certificate Programs - 2012 Census

Path	Fields/Topics	Under- graduate	Graduate	Professional	Total
	Alternative/Renewable Energy	20	7	2	29
Path 1	Engineering/Technology/Science	17	7	3	27
	Wind, Solar, or Nuclear Energy	4	3	2	9
Path 1 Totals		41	17	7	65
	Built Environment	3	0	0	3
	Business Administration/ Management/Economics	16	7	1	24
	Energy Law	0	3	0	3
Path 2	Energy Policy	3	2	0	5
	Energy Studies/General	10	2	0	12
	Resources/Water	4	0	0	4
	Sustainability/ Environment/Climate	24	6	4	34
	Systems	3	1	1	5
Path 2 Totals		63	21	6	90

Table 8B. Fields and Topics of of Energy Minors and Certificate Programs - 2016 Census

Path	Fields/Topics	Under- graduate	Graduate	Professional	Total
Path 1	Engineering	21	7	2	30
Paul I	Science & Technology	47	21	5	73
Path 1 Totals		68	28	7	103
	Business and Economics	3	4	0	7
	Climate	2	0	0	2
	Design and Planning/ Built Environment	2	1	2	5
Path 2	Education	0	1	0	1
	Environment & Sustainability	26	9	6	41
	Management and Leadership	4	8	1	13
	Natural Resources	3	0	0	3
	Policy & Law	5	12	0	17
Path 2 Totals		45	35	9	89



## Limitations

There are several limitations to this analysis that should be considered in interpreting the results and deriving implications. First, we may have been unable to identify some programs that focus on environment, sustainability, natural resources or energy because they do not explicitly refer to these categories in the program name. Newly established programs and recent changes to existing programs may also not be represented. Second, defining the focus of census data as on energy sources other than fossil fuels, hydroelectric power and nuclear energy limits understanding of how programs focused on these traditional energy sources might be changing, especially in relation to non-traditional programs.

In addition, there is a possibility that Path 1 programs may be diversifying content to add more social dimensions. If this is the case, we may not be seeing the full magnitude of growth in Path 2 forms of knowledge development. We also have not analyzed enrollments of the different types of programs; the demographics and diversity of different programs may also shed light on

programmatic balance. We can assume in the positive direction that we do not often see program growth without enrollment growth (typical of higher education trends). It remains possible, however, that even though there are fewer institutions hosting Path 1-type programs, enrollments may be increasing.

## Discussion

The significant finding from this analysis is that to tell the full story regarding the evolution of energy education programming in higher education we must look beyond the overall increase in NTBE programming, even if we account for the different trajectories of disciplinary/professional, interdisciplinary/general, and minors & certificates. By distinguishing NTBE programming according to fields or topics that correspond to Sarewitz's distinction between Path 1 and Path 2 approaches to knowledge development, we can characterize trends in a way that allows for substantive and critical discussion of prevailing trends.

It is most significant to note that, while overall NTBE programming increased by 48 percent from 2012 to 2016, there was no growth in that time period in degree programs classified as Path 1, either in the professional/ disciplinary category or in the interdisciplinary/general category. For Path 1 fields, all of the significant growth occurred within minors and certificate programs, which grew by 58 percent. Conversely, there was significant growth in Path 2 fields, both in programs classified as disciplinary/professional (36 percent increase) and those classified as interdisciplinary/general (66 percent increase). Path 2 fields however saw no significant increase in minors and certificate programs.

...TO TELL THE FULL
STORY REGARDING
THE EVOLUTION OF
ENERGY EDUCATION
PROGRAMMING IN
HIGHER EDUCATION
WE MUST LOOK
BEYOND THE OVERALL
INCREASE IN NTBE
PROGRAMMING...

On the one hand, these findings confirm Blockstein's insight that energy is more than a technical challenge for society. At the same time, we note Sarewitz's concerns that innovative potential not be diminished due to a shift in attention to Path 2. It is interesting to note that the growth in minors may be a nod to this concern in some way. One might understand a growth in minors and concentrations as being a way of enhancing technical and physical science knowledge for students in Path 2. Conversely, one might be concerned that unless we also have a critical mass of educational activity along Path 1, a minor may not allow for the technical innovations we might need to transform as we would desire.

One of the benefits of having a diversity of educational offerings within the energy education landscape is that different types of students are attracted to different types of programs. Opening up alternative pathways to knowledge development results in greater diversity of students who are engaging with energy education. Recognizing the importance of the growth in Path 2 educational opportunities, the question we ask in the academy, then, is: how do we ensure the disciplinary foundations for technical and scientific innovations related to sustainable energy pathways? One of the challenges in Path 1 from an academic perspective is appropriately keeping up with technical changes in the field, which requires ongoing investment at multiple levels. Given this, we might consider that the growth of Path 2 programs in fact may support Path 1 programs by appropriate attention to policies that support sustainable energy pathways.

These issues are not only of academic import. Educational programs that emphasize different pathways of knowledge development will provide different mixes of the training and skill-sets that employers are asking for and students are hoping to provide. The reality of higher education, furthermore, is that enrollment varies in part on the basis of labor markets. The fluctuating prices of energy (which have gone down since 2008) have depressed much of the labor market around traditional energy resources, which is growing at a slower rate now. At the same time, job creation in the fields of renewable energy and energy efficiency has increased<sup>2</sup>. This might explain some of the change in balance between Path 1 and Path 2.

The interplay between higher education and labor markets is complex and dynamic – educational programmers must both adapt to fluctuating labor markets *and* forge the way towards needed societal developments and transitions yet to come. As we work to achieve the right balance of energy programming in the US higher education landscape, therefore, we would do well to heed the reminders of both Sarewitz and Blockstein and co-authors. Sarewitz reminds us not to focus so intently on Path 2 that we forget to invest in Path 1; Blockstein reminds us that technical innovation needs to be coupled with societal engagement for greatest impact, thus we must not fail to invest in Path 2. In a very real way, students who follow these complementary pathways to knowledge development in the field of energy will define the energy landscape going forward.

<sup>2</sup> https://www.usenergyjobs.org/report/https://irena.org/-/media/Files/IRENA/Agency/Publication/2018/May/IRENA\_RE\_Jobs\_Annual\_Review\_2018.pdf



## Literature Cited

- Blockstein, D. E., Middlecamp, C. H., & Perkins, J. H. (2015). Energy Education: Easy, Difficult, or Both? *Journal of Sustainability Education*, 8.
- Sarewitz, D. (2010). Against Holism. In *The Oxford Handbook of Interdisciplinarity.* pp 65-75, Frodeman, R (ed.). Oxford University Press.
- Vincent, S., Bunn, S., & Stevens, S. (2012). Results from the 2012 Census of US Four Year Colleges and Universities. National Council for Science and the Environment: Washington, DC.
- Vincent, S., Rao, S., Fu, Q., Gu, K., Huang, X., Lindaman, K., Mittleman, E., Nguyen, K., Rosenstein, R., Suh, Y. (2017). Scope of Interdisciplinary Environmental, Sustainability, and Energy Baccalaureate and Graduate Education in the United States. National Council for Science and the Environment: Washington DC.

## APPENDIX

Table A. Carnegie Classifications Included in the 2016 Census

Carnegie Code	Basic Carnegie Classification	2010 Carnegie	-	2015 Carnegie Data	
15	Doctoral Universities: Highest Research Activity	108		116	
16	Doctoral Universities: Higher Research Activity	98		106	
17	Doctoral Universities: Moderate Research Activity		75		93
1	Total Doctoral Universities	281		315	
18	Master's Colleges and Universities: Larger Programs		381		371
19	Master's Colleges and Universities: Medium Programs		165		191
20	Master's Colleges and Universities: Small Programs		96		121
1	Total Master's Colleges and Universities		642		683
21	Baccalaureate Colleges: Arts and Sciences		266		244
22	Baccalaureate Colleges: Diverse Fields		323		262
23	Baccalaureate/Associate's Colleges: Mixed Baccalaureate/Ass	sociate's	58		79
14	Baccalaureate/Associate's Colleges: Associate's Dominant (ne	ew in 2015)	-		72
7	Total Baccalaureate Colleges				657
33	Tribal Colleges	32	32 35		
1	Total Four Year				1,690
24	24 Special Focus Four-Year: Faith-Related Institutions				304
25	Special Focus Four-Year: Medical Schools & Centers		50		50
26	Special Focus Four-Year: Other Health Professions Schools		162		134
27	Special Focus Four-Year: Engineering Schools		6		5
28	Special Focus Four-Year: Other Technology-Related Schools		3		4
29	Special Focus Four-Year: Business and Management Schools		20		26
30	Special Focus Four-Year: Arts, Music and Design Schools		60		59
31	Special Focus Four-Year: Law Schools		29		29
32	Special Focus Four-Year: Other Special Focus Institutions		16		26
7	Total Special Focus Four Year	644		637	
Special D	Special Designations Four-Year				ar Special Focus
Historica	lly Black College and Universities	82	5	82	7
Hispanic-	Hispanic-serving Institutions 65				15
Minority-	Minority-serving Institutions 168				31
Women's	Women's Colleges 45				1

Assessing Trends Across Two Pathways To Knowledge Development

Table B. Disciplinary/professional degree programs with energy specializations (2016 NCSE Census)

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Degree Programs				
Doctoral Universities - Highest Research Activity							
				Eng	School of Electrical, Computer and Energ Engineering; Ira A. Fulton Schools of Engineering		Bachelor of Electrical Engineering: Electric Power and Energy Systems
Arizona State		School of Sustainability	BS Sustainability: Sustainable Energy, Materials and Technology, PhD in Sustainable Energy				
University	Public	The Design School; Herberger Institute for Design and the Arts	MS Built Environment: Energy Performance and Climate Responsive Architecture				
		School for Engineering of Matter, Transport and Energy; Ira A. Fulton Schools of Engineering	Professional Science Master's: Solar Energy Engineering and Commercialization				
			Master of International Affairs: Energy and Environment				
Columbia University	Private NFP	School of International and Public Affairs	Master of Public Affairs: Energy and Environment				
		Department of Earth and Environmental Engineering; School of Engineering and Applied Science	MS Earth Resources Engineering: Sustainable Energy				
Cornell University	Private NFP	School of Chemical and Biomolecular Engineering; College of Engineering	Master of Engineering in Chemical Engineering: Energy Economics and Engineering				
,			PhD Chemical Engineering: Energy Economics and Engineering				
Duke University	Private NFP	Division of Environmental Sciences and Policy; Nicholas School of the Environment	Master of Environmental Management: Energy and Environment				
Florida State University	Public	Department of Mechanical Engineering; College of Engineering	MS Mechanical Engineering: Sustainable Energy				
		Private NFP School of Law	Master of Laws in Environmental and Energy Law: International Environmental Law				
George Washington University	Private NFP		Master of Laws in Environmental and Energy Law: Government Procurement and Environmental Law				
			Master of Laws in Environmental and Energy Law: Environmental Law				
				Master of Laws in Environmental and Energy Law: Energy and Environmental Law			

Assessing Trends Across Two Pathways To Knowledge Development

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Degree Programs			
Doctoral Universities - Highest Research Activity - continued						
Indiana University		Integrated Program in the Environment; College of Arts and Sciences and School of Public and Environmental Affairs	BA Environmental and Sustainability Studies: Sustainable Energy and Resources			
Bloomington	Public	School of Public and Environmental Affairs	Master of Public Affairs: Energy			
		School of Public and Environmental Affairs	MS Environmental Science: Energy			
Iowa State University	Public	Department of Mechanical Engineering; College of Engineering	Master of Engineering: Energy Systems Engineering			
North Carolina State	Public	Department of Chemical and Biomolecular Engineering; College of	BS Chemical Engineering: Sustainable Engineering, Energy and the Environment			
University at Raleigh	rubtic	Engineering	MS Chemical Engineering: Biofuels and Renewable Energy Technology			
The Ohio State University	Public	School of Architecture; College of Engineering	Master of City and Regional Planning: Energy, Environment and Sustainability			
Oregon State	Public	Environmental Science Undergraduate Program, College of Earth, Ocean, and Atmospheric Sciences	BS Environmental Sciences: Alternative Energy			
University	. done	School of Public Policy; College of Liberal Arts	BS Political Science: Environmental and Energy Politics			
	Public	Department of Geosciences, College of Earth and Mineral Sciences	BS Earth Science and Policy: Energy			
			BS Engineering: Energy			
			BS Energy Business and Finance: Energy Systems			
Pennsylvania State University		Department of Energy and Mineral Engineering; College of Earth and Mineral Sciences and College of Business	MS Energy and Mineral Engineering: Energy Management and Policy, Fuel Science or Environmental Health and Safety			
			PhD Energy and Mineral Engineering: Energy Management and Policy, Fuel Science or Environmental Health and Safety			
		Department of Chemical Engineering;	BS Chemical Engineering: Energy and Fuels Engineering			
		College of Engineering	PhD Chemical Engineering: Energy and Fuels Engineering			
Pica University	Drivata NED	Policy Studies Program; School of Social Sciences	BA Policy Studies: Energy Policy Studies			
Rice University	Private NFP	Department of Economics; School of Social Sciences	Master of Energy Economics			

Assessing Trends Across Two Pathways To Knowledge Development

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Degree Programs			
Doctoral Universities - Highest Research Activity - continued						
		Public Policy Program; School of	BA Public Policy: Resources, Environment and Energy Policy			
		Humanities and Sciences	Master of Public Policy: Resources, Environment and Energy Policy			
		Earth Systems Program; School of Earth, Energy and Environmental Science	BS Earth Systems: Energy, Science and Technology			
			BS Civil and Environmental Engineering: Atmosphere and Energy			
Stanford University	Private NFP	Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering; School of Engineering	MS Civil and Environmental Engineering: Atmosphere and Energy			
			PhD Civil and Environmental Engineering: Atmosphere and Energy			
		Department of Energy Resource Engineering; School of Earth, Energy and Environmental Science	BS Engineering: Energy Resource Engineering			
			MS Engineering: Energy Resource Engineering			
			PhD Engineering: Energy Resource Engineering			
	Private NFP	Department of Mechanical Engineering; College of Engineering	BS Mechanical Engineering: Energy Systems			
Temple University			MS Mechanical Engineering: Energy Systems			
		Center for Technology, Engineering and Management	BS Engineering Technology: Environmental Technology or Energy Technology			
Texas Tech University	Private NFP	Rawls College of Business	Bachelors of Business Administration: Energy Commerce			
Tulane University	Private NFP	School of Law	Master of Laws: Environmental and Energy Law			
University of Arizona	Public	School of Architecture; College of Architecture, Planning and Landscape Architecture	MS Architecture: Design and Energy Conservation			

Assessing Trends Across Two Pathways To Knowledge Development

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Degree Programs			
Doctoral Universities - Highest Research Activity - continued						
		Engineering Science Program; College of Engineering	BS Engineering: Energy			
		Center for Law, Energy and the Environment	Master of Laws: Environmental and Energy Law			
University of		Department of Civil and Environmental	MS Civil and Environmental Engineering: Energy, Civil Infrastructure and Climate			
California, Berkeley	Public	Engineering; College of Engineering	PhD Civil and Environmental Engineering: Energy, Civil Infrastructure and Climate			
		Department of Agricultural and Resource Economics; College of Natural Resources	PhD Agriculture and Resource Economics: Environmental and Energy Economics			
		Center for Law, Energy and the Environment	Juris Doctor: Environmental and Energy Law			
University of California, Davis	Public	Department of Environmental Science and Policy; College of Agricultural and Environmental Sciences	BS Environmental Policy Analysis and Planning: Energy and Transportation Planning			
University of California, Santa Barbara	Public	Bren School of Environmental Science and Management	Master of Environmental Science and Management: Energy and Climate			
University of Colorado Boulder	Public	Environmental Engineering Program; College of Engineering and Applied Science	BS Environmental Engineering: Energy Conversion			
University of Delaware	Public	Environmental Science and Studies Program; College of Earth, Ocean and Environment	BS Environmental Science: Energy and Environment			
Detaware		Center For Energy and Environmental Policy	PhD Energy and Environmental Policy: Energy Policy			
		Department of Finance; Bauer College of Business	Bachelor of Business Administration: Global Energy Management			
University of Houston	Public	Dusiness	MS Business: Global Energy Management			
		Environment, Energy and Natural Resources Center; College of Law	Master of Laws: Energy, Environment, and Natural Resources Law			
University of Illinois at Chicago	Public	Department of Mechanical and Industrial Engineering; College of Engineering	Master of Energy Engineering			

Assessing Trends Across Two Pathways To Knowledge Development

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Degree Programs			
Doctoral Universities - Highest Research Activity - continued						
			BS Technical Systems Management: Renewable Energy Systems			
		Department of Agricultural and Biological	BS Agricultural Engineering: Renewable Energy Systems			
		Engineering; College of Agricultural, Consumer, and Environmental Sciences	MS Agricultural and Biological Engineering: Energy and Sustainability Engineering			
University of			PhD Agricultural and Biological Engineering: Energy and Sustainability Engineering			
Illinois at Urbana- Champaign	Public	Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering; College of Engineering	BS Civil Engineering: Energy-Water- Environment Sustainability, Sustainable and Resilient Infrastructure Systems, or Environmental Engineering and Science			
		Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering; College of Engineering	MS Civil Engineering: MS Energy-Water- Environment Sustainability, Sustainable and Resilient Infrastructure Systems, or Environmental Engineering and Science			
			Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering; College of Engineering	PhD Civil Engineering: Energy-Water- Environment Sustainability, Sustainable and Resilient Infrastructure Systems, or Environmental Engineering and Science		
Hat water of	Public	Engineering Sustainable Systems Program; College of Engineering	Master of Engineering: Energy Systems			
University of Michigan-		Energy System Engineering Program; College of Engineering Integrative Systems and Design	Master of Energy System Engineering			
University of Minnesota Twin Cities	Public	Department of Bioproducts and Biosystems Engineering; College of Food, Agriculture and Natural Resource Sciences and College of Science and Engineering	BS Sustainable Systems Management: Energy Systems			
University of Nebraska-Lincoln	Public	Department of Agricultural Economics; School of Natural Resources; College of Agricultural Sciences and Natural Resources	BS Natural Resources and Environmental Economics: Energy Economics			
	College of Business  Private NFP  Department of Mechanical and Energy Engineering; College of Engineering	College of Business	Master in Business Administration: Energy			
University of North Texas			BS Engineering: Mechanical and Energy Engineering			
		Engineering; College of Engineering	BS Engineering: Mechanical and Energy Engineering			
University of Oklahoma	Public	College of Business	Bachelor of Business Administration: Energy Management			

Assessing Trends Across Two Pathways To Knowledge Development

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Degree Programs			
Doctoral Universities - Highest Research Activity - continued						
University of Pennsylvania	Private NFP	Department of History and Sociology; School of Arts and Sciences	BS History and Sociology: Energy, Environment and Technology			
University of	Public	Graduate School of Public and	Master of International Development: Energy and Environment			
Pittsburgh		International Affairs	Master of Public Administration: Energy and Environment			
University of South Florida	Public	Patel College of Global Sustainability	MA Global Sustainability: Sustainable Energy			
		Environmental Studies Program; College	BA Environmental Studies: Sustainability, Energy and Society			
University of Southern California	Private NFP	of Letters, Arts and Sciences	BS Environmental Studies: Sustainability, Energy and Society			
		Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering; School of Engineering	PhD Environmental Engineering: Energy and the Environment			
University of Tennessee-Knoxville	Public	Bredesen Center for Interdisciplinary Research and Graduate Education; College of Arts and Sciences; College of Agricultural Sciences and Natural Resources; College of Engineering and Oak Ridge National Laboratory	PhD Engineering: Energy Science and Engineering			
		Department of Geological Sciences; John A. and Katherine G. Jackson School of Geosciences	MA Geosciences: Energy and Earth Resources			
			MS Geosciences: Energy and Earth Resources			
		Department of Materials Science and Engineering; Cockrell School of Engineering and Texas Materials Institute	MS Engineering: Clean Energy Materials			
			PhD Engineering: Clean Energy Materials			
University of Texas at	Public	Department of Electrical and Computing Engineering; Cockrell School of	MS Electrical Engineering: Energy Systems			
Austin	Tublic	Engineering	PhD Electrical Engineering: Energy Systems			
		School of Law	Masters of Laws: Global Energy, International Arbitration and Environmental Law			
		LBJ School of Public Affairs	Master of Global Policy Studies: International Energy, Environment and Technology			
		McCombs School of Business	Master of Business Administration: Energy Finance			

Assessing Trends Across Two Pathways To Knowledge Development

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Degree Programs			
Doctoral Universities - Highest Research Activity - continued						
		Department of Mechanical Engineering; College of Engineering	BS Mechanical Engineering: Thermal Science and Energy Engineering			
University of Utah	Public	Department of Chemical Engineering; College of Engineering	BS Chemical Engineering: Energy Engineering			
		Wallace Steger Center for Land, Resources and the Environment; College of Law	Master of Laws: Energy, Environmental, and Natural Resources Law			
University of		La Follette School of Public Affairs	Master of Public Affairs: Energy and Environmental Policy certificate			
Wisconsin-Madison	Public	La Follette School of Public Affairs	Master of International Public Affairs: Energy and Environmental Policy certificate			
Washington State	D. I. I.	Department of Biological Systems	MS Biosystems Engineering: Bioenergy and Bioproducts			
University	Public	Engineering; College of Agricultural, Human, and Natural Resource Sciences	PhD Biosystems Engineering: Bioenergy and Bioproducts			
	ouis Private NFP	Department of Energy, Environmental and Chemical Engineering; College of Arts and Sciences	PhD Engineering: Energy, Environmental and Chemical Engineering			
		Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences; College of Arts and Sciences	BS Environmental Earth Sciences: Climate and Energy			
			Master of Engineering in Energy, Environmental and Chemical Engineering: Advanced Energy Technologies			
Washington University in St Louis		Department of Energy, Environmental and	Master of Engineering in Energy, Environmental and Chemical Engineering: Energy and Environmental Management			
		Chemical Engineering; College of Arts and Sciences	Master of Engineering in Energy, Environmental and Chemical Engineering: Energy and Environmental Nanotechnology			
			PhD Engineering: Energy, Environmental and Chemical Engineering			
West Virginia University	Public	College of Law	Master of Laws: Energy and Sustainable Development Law			
		Department of Geology and Geophysics; Yale College	BS Geology and Geophysics: Environmental and Energy Geoscience			
Yale University	Private NFP	School of Forestry and Environmental Studies	Master of Environmental Management: Energy and the Environment			

Assessing Trends Across Two Pathways To Knowledge Development

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Degree Programs		
Doctoral Universities - Higher Research Activity					
Catholic University of America	Private NFP	Department of Physics; School of Arts and Sciences	MS Physics: Nuclear Environmental Protection		
			BS Chemistry: Renewable Energy and Catalysis		
Florida Institute of Technology	Private NFP	Department of Chemistry; College of Science	MS Chemistry: Renewable Energy and Catalysis		
			PhD Chemistry: Renewable Energy and Catalysis		
			MS Chemical Engineering: Energy and Environmental Economics		
Illinois Institute of Technology	Private NFP	Department of Chemical and Biological Engineering; Armour College of Engineering	Master of Chemical Engineering: Energy and Environment Economics		
			PhD Chemical Engineering: Energy and Environment Economics		
Illinois State University	Public	School of Biological Sciences; College of Arts and Sciences	BS Biological Sciences: Bioenergy		
Indiana University- Purdue University- Indianapolis	Public	Department of Mechanical Engineering; Purdue School of Engineering and Technology	BS Engineering: Energy Engineering		
Lehigh University	Private NFP	Energy Systems Engineering Institute; College of Engineering and Applied Science	Professional Master of Engineering: Energy Systems Engineering		
Mississippi State University	Public	Department of Agricultural and Biological Engineering; College of Agriculture and Life Sciences; Division of Agriculture, Forestry, and Veterinary Medicine	BS Engineering Technology: Bioenvironmental Systems, Renewable Energy		
Montana State University	Public	Sustainable Food and Bioenergy Systems Program; Department of Land Resources and Environmental Science, Department of Plant Sciences and Plant Pathology, Department of Health and Human Development and Department of Animal and Range Sciences, College of Agriculture	BS Agriculture: Sustainable Food and Bioenergy Systems		
New Mexico State		Department of Engineering Technology	BS Mechanical Engineering Technology: Renewable Energy Technology		
University	Public	and Surveying Engineering; College of Engineering	BS Electronics and Computer Engineering Technology: Renewable Energy Technology		
North Carolina A & T State University	Public	School of Technology	MS Technology Management: Energy Security and Sustainability		

Assessing Trends Across Two Pathways To Knowledge Development

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Degree Programs		
Doctoral Universities - Higher Research Activity - continued					
		Institute for the Study of the Environment,	BA Environmental Studies: Energy Studies		
Northern Illinois University	Public	Sustainability, and Energy	BS Environmental Studies: Energy Studies		
Offiversity		Department of Technology; College of Engineering and Engineering Technology	BS Technology: Energy and Environmental Technology		
Ohio University	Public	Department of Mechanical Engineering; College of Engineering and Technology	BS Engineering: Energy Engineering		
Southern Illinois		Department of Agribusiness Economics; College of Agricultural Sciences	BS Agribusiness Economics: Energy and Environmental Policy		
University- Carbondale	Public	Environmental Resources and Policy Program; Graduate School	PhD Environmental Resources and Policy: Energy and Mineral Resources		
University of Colorado Denver	Public	Business School	MS Management: Global Energy Management		
University of Dayton	Private NFP	Department of Mechanical and Aerospace Engineering; College of Engineering	MS Engineering: Renewable and Clean Energy		
University of Denver	Private NFP	Environmental Policy and Management Program; University College Professional and Continuing Studies	Master of Applied Science: Environmental Policy and Management:Energy and Sustainability		
	Public	Department of Biological Engineering; College of Engineering	BS Biological Engineering: Bioenergy Engineering		
University of Idaho			Master of Engineering: Biological and Agricultural Engineering: BioEnergy		
			PhD Engineering: Biological and Agricultural Engineering: BioEnergy		
University of Maine	Public	School of Economics; College of Natural	BA Economics: Renewable Energy		
offiversity of Marine	Tublic	Sciences, Forestry and Agriculture	BS Economics: Renewable Energy		
University of Montana	Public	Environmental Studies Program; College of Humanities and Sciences	BA Environmental Studies: Sustainability Studies - Food, Water, Energy, Business		
University of New Hampshire	Public	Department of Chemical Engineering; College of Engineering and Physical Sciences	BS Chemical Engineering: Energy		
University of North Carolina at Charlotte	Public	Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering; College of Engineering	BS Civil Engineering: Water Resource and Environmental Engineering, Energy Infrastructure		
		Institute for Energy Studies; School of Engineering and Mines	PhD Engineering: Energy or Environmental		
University of North Dakota	Public	Energy Systems Engineering Graduate	MS Engineering: Energy Systems Engineering		
		Program; School of Engineering and Mines	Master of Engineering: Environmental Engineering, Energy Systems Engineering		

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Degree Programs			
	Doctoral Universities - Higher Research Activity - continued					
			BA Economics: Energy Management			
		School of Energy Economics, Policy and	BS Economics: Energy Management			
		Commerce; College of Business	Master of Energy Business			
University of Tulsa	Private NFP		Masters of Business Administration: Energy Management			
		College of Law	Master of Laws in Energy and Natural Resources Law for Foreign Lawyers			
			Master of Jurisprudence in Energy Law			
Worcester Polytechnic Institute	Private NFP	Department of Chemical Engineering; Division of Engineering	BS Chemical Engineering: Energy			
	Doctor	al Universities - Moderate Research Acti	vity			
Boise State University	Public	Department of Public Policy and Administration; School of Public Service	Master of Public Administration: Energy Policy and Administration			
			BS Physics: Renewable Energy Emphasis			
Edgewood College	Private NFP	Department of Chemistry, Geosciences and Physics; School of Arts and Science	BS Chemistry: Renewable Energy Emphasis			
Indiana University of Pennsylvania	Public	Department of Geoscience; College of Natural Sciences and Mathematics	BS Geology: Energy Resources			
Rochester Institute of		Department of Manufacturing and	BS Mechanical Engineering: Clean and Renewable Energy			
Technology	Private NFP	Mechanical Engineering; College of Applied Science and Technology	BS Electrical Engineering: Clean and Renewable Energy			
San Francisco State University	Public	School of Engineering; College of Science and Engineering	MS Engineering: Energy System			
University of Hartford	Private NFP	Department of Mechanical Engineering; College of Engineering, Technology and Architecture	BS Mechanical Engineering: Energy and Sustainability			
Wright State University	Public	Department of Mechanical and Materials Engineering; College of Engineering and Computer Science	MS Engineering: Renewable and Clean Energy			
	Master's	s Colleges and Universities - Large Progr	rams			
Appalachian State University	Public	Department of Sustainable Technology and the Built Environment; College of Fine and Applied Arts	MS Engineering: Renewable Energy Engineering			
California State University-Chico	Public	Department of Geological and Environmental Sciences; College of Natural Sciences	BS Environmental Science: Energy and Earth Resources			
Eastern Kentucky University	Public	School of Applied Arts and Technology; College of Business and Technology	BS Agriculture: Agricultural Energy Systems Management			

Assessing Trends Across Two Pathways To Knowledge Development

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Degree Programs		
Master's Colleges and Universities - Large Programs - continued					
Excelsior College	Private NFP	School of Business and Technology	BS Technology Management: Renewable Energy		
Maharishi University of Management	Private NFP	Department of Sustainable Living	BA Sustainable Living: Renewable Energy		
Oklahoma City	Private NFP	Energy Program; Meinders School of	MS Laws: Energy Legal Studies		
University	FIIVALE INFF	Business	MS Business: Energy Management		
Saint Francis University	Private NFP	Department of Mathematics, Engineering, and Computer Science; School of Sciences	BS Environmental Engineering: Renewable Energy		
San Jose State University	Public	Department of Environmental Studies; College of Social Sciences	BS Environmental Studies: Energy		
Sonoma State	5.11	Department of Environmental Studies	BA Environmental Studies and Planning: Energy Management and Design		
University	Public	and Planning; School of Social Sciences	BS Environmental Studies and Planning: Energy Management and Design		
Southeast Missouri State University	Public	Department of Industrial and Engineering Technology; School of Polytechic Studies	BS Technology Management: Sustainable Energy Systems Management		
Stockton University	Public	Sustainability Program; School of Natural Science and Mathematics	BS Sustainability: Energy		
University of Central Missouri	Public	School of Environmental, Physical and Applied Sciences; College of Science and Technology	BS Chemistry: Alternative Energy		
University of Colorado Colorado Springs	Public	College of Engineering and Applied Science	Master of Engineering: Energy Engineering		
	Master's	Colleges and Universities - Medium Prog	grams		
Arizona State		School of Electrical, Computer and Energy	BS Electronic Engineering Technology: Alternative Energy Technologies		
University Polytechnic	Public	Engineering; Ira A. Fulton Schools of Engineering	MS Technology: Alternative Energy Technologies or Environmental Technology Management		
Ferris State University	Public	College of Engineering Technology	BS Engineering: Energy Systems Engineering		
Franklin Pierce University	Private NFP	Masters of Business Administration: Energy and Sustainability Studies Program; College of Graduate and Professional Studies	Master of Business Administration: Energy and Sustainability Studies		
Humboldt State	D hit	Department of Environmental Resources Engineering; College of Natural Resources and Sciences	BS Environmental Resources Engineering: Energy Resources		
University	Public		MS Environmental Systems: Energy Technology and Policy		

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Degree Programs		
Master's Colleges and Universities - Medium Programs - continued					
John Brown University	Private NFP	Department of Engineering; Division of Engineering and Construction Management	BS Engineering: Renewable Energy		
Kettering University	Private NFP	Department of Mechanical Engineering	MS Engineering: Sustainable Energy and Hybrid Technology		
Minnesota State University-Moorhead	Public	Department of Physics and Astronomy; College of Social and Natural Sciences	BS Sustainability: Energy Sustainability		
Minot State University	Public	Department of Accounting and Finance	BS Business: Energy Economics and Finance		
Union Graduate	Private NED Denartment	Department of Geology	BA Environmental Policy: Energy and Sustainability		
College			BS Environmental Science: Energy		
University of the Southwest	Private NFP	School of Business and Professional Studies	Bachelor of Business Administration: Energy Management		
Wheeling Jesuit University	Private NFP	Department of Environment and Sustainability	BS Environment and Sustainability: Sustainable Biofuels		
			BS Environment and Sustainability: Sustainable Energy Systems		
	Ва	ccalaureate Colleges - Arts and Sciences			
College of the Atlantic	Private NFP	Human Ecology Program	BA Human Ecology: Climate Change and Energy		
Gettysburg College	Private NFP	Department of Environmental Studies	BA Environmental Studies: Energy and the Environment		
			BS Environmental Studies: Energy and the Environment		
Lewis and Clark College	Private NFP	Law School	Master of Studies in Environmental, Natural Resources, and Energy Law		
			Master of Laws: Environmental, Natural Resources, and Energy Law		
			Juris Doctor: Environmental, Natural Resources, and Energy Law		
SUNY Canton (College of Technology)	Public	School of Engineering Technology	Bachelor of Technology: Alternative and Renewable Energy Systems		
University of Pittsburgh-Johnstown	Public	Department of Energy and Earth Resources; Natural Science Division	BS Energy and Earth Resources: Energy Resource Geology or Environmental Geology		

Assessing Trends Across Two Pathways To Knowledge Development

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Degree Programs			
Baccalaureate Colleges - Diverse Fields						
Dordt College	Private NFP	Department of Engineering	BS Engineering: Energy Systems			
Keystone College	Private NFP	Division of Natural Sciences and Mathematics	BS Environmental Resource Management: Petroleum and Alternative Energy Sources			
Marietta College	Private NFP	Department of Business and Economics	BA Management: Land and Energy Management			
Oregon Institute of Technology	Public	College of Engineering, Technology and Management	BS Engineering: Renewable Energy Engineering			
		Department of Cvil Engineering; College of Engineering, Technology and Management	BS Civil Engineering: Environmental			
		Renewable Energy Engineering Program; College of Engineering, Technology and Management	MS Engineering: Renewable Energy Engineering			
Oklahoma Baptist University	Private NFP	Paul Dickinson College of Business; Graduate College	Master of Business Administration: Energy Management			
University of Minnesota-Crookston	Public	Department of Agriculture and Natural Resources	BS Agricultural Systems Management: Bio-Fuels and Renewable Energy			
Baccalaureate/Associate's Colleges - Mixed						
Pennsylvania College of Technology	Public	School of Construction and Design Technologies	BS Electrical Technology: Renewable Energy Technologies			
SUNY College of Agriculture and Technology at Cobleskill	Public	Center for Environmental Science and Technology; School of Agriculture and Natural Resources	Bachelor of Technology: Environmental and Energy Technologies			
Special Focus Four-Year						
Vermont Law School	Private NFP	Law School	Master of Laws: Energy Regulation and Law			

Table C. Interdisciplinary/general non-traditional broad energy degree programs (2016 NCSE Census)

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Degree Programs		
Doctoral Universities - Highest Research Activity					
Boston University	Private NFP	Department of Earth and Environment; College of Arts and Sciences	MA Energy and Environment		
Carnegie Mellon University	Private NFP	Carnegie Institute of Technology; Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering and Department of Engineering and Public Policy	MS Energy Science, Technology and Policy		
		Energy Science, Technology and Policy Program; College of Engineering	MS Energy Science, Technology and Policy		
Cornell University	Private NFP	Department of Earth and Atmospheric Sciences; College of Engineering	Master of Energy Studies		
Georgetown University	Private NFP	Program in Science, Technology and International Affairs; School of Foreign Service	BS Science, Technology, and International Affairs: Energy and Environment		
Harvard University	Private NFP	Graduate School of Design	Master in Design Studies: Energ and Environments		
Iowa State University	Public	Wind Energy Science, Engineering, and Policy Program; College of Engineering; College of Liberal Arts and Sciences and College of Agriculture and Life Sciences	PhD Wind Energy Science, Engineering, and Policy		
	Private NFP	Energy Systems Program; Graduate School of Engineering	MS Energy Systems		
Northeastern University		Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering; Graduate School of Engineering	MS Engineering and Public Policy: Energy and Environment		
	Public	Department of Energy and Mineral Engineering; College of Earth and Mineral Sciences	BA Energy and Sustainability Policy		
Pennsylvania State			BS Energy and Sustainability Policy		
University		Renewable Energy and Sustainability Systems Program; Penn State World Campus (online)	Master of Professional Studies: Renewable Energy and Sustainability Systems		
Syracuse University	Private NFP	Department of Physics; College of Arts and Sciences	BA Energy and Its Impacts		
Texas A & M University- College Station	Public	Texas A & M Energy Institute	MS Energy		
	Private NFP	National Wind Institute	BS Wind Energy		
Texas Tech University			PhD Wind Energy		
University of California	Public	Energy and Resources Program; Graduate College	MA Energy and Resources		
University of California, Berkeley			MS Energy and Resources PhD Energy and Resources		

Assessing Trends Across Two Pathways To Knowledge Development

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Degree Programs			
Doctoral Universities - Highest Research Activity - continued						
University of California,	Public	Energy Systems Program; Graduate College	MS Energy Systems			
Davis			PhD Energy Systems			
	Public	Center for Energy and Environmental Policy	BS Energy and Environmental Policy			
University of Delaware			Master of Energy and Environmental Policy			
			PhD Energy and Environmental Policy			
University of Pennsylvania	Private FP	Vagelos Integrated Program in Energy Research; School of Arts and Sciences and School of Engineering and Applied Science	BS Vagelos Integrated Program in Energy Research			
University of Rochester	Private NFP	Department of Chemical Engineering; School of Engineering and Applied Sciences	MS Alternative Energy			
University of Tennessee, Knoxville	Public	Bredesen Center for Interdisciplinary Research and Graduate Education; College of Arts and Sciences; College of Agricultural Sciences and Natural Resources; College of Engineering and Oak Ridge National Laboratory	PhD Energy Science and Engineering			
Wayne State University	Public	Alternative Energy Technology Program; College of Engineering	MS Alternative Energy Technology			
West Virginia University	Public	Division of Resource Management; Davis College of Agriculture, Natural Resources, and Design	BS Environmental and Energy Resources Management			
Doctoral Universities - Higher Research Activity						
Illinois State University	Public	Department of Technology; College of Applied Science and Technology	BS Renewable Energy			
Miami University (Ohio)	Public	Institute for the Environment and Sustainability; College of Arts and Science	BA Energy			
Midili Offiversity (Offio)			BS Energy			
Michigan Technological	Public	Department of Social Sciences; College of Arts and Sciences	MS Environmental and Energy Policy			
University			PhD Environmental and Energy Policy			
North Carolina A & T State University	Public	Energy and Environmental Systems Program; College of Arts and Sciences	PhD Energy and Environment Systems			
Southern Illinois University, arbondale	Public	Advanced Energy and Fuels Management Program; Graduate School	Professional Science Master's: Advanced Energy and Fuels Management			
University of Wyoming	Public	School of Energy Resources	BS Energy Resource Management and Development			

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Degree Programs
	Doctoral Ur	niversities - Moderate Research Activity	
SUNY College of Environmental Science and Forestry	Public	Department of Forest and Natural Resource Management	BS Sustainable Energy Management
	Master's Coll	eges and Universities - Larger Programs	
Central Washington University	Public	Institute for Integrated Energy Studies; College of the Sciences	BS Integrated Energy Management
Creighton University	Private NFP	Energy Technology Program; College of Arts and Sciences	BS Sustainable Energy Science
Eastern Illinois University	Public	Sustainable Energy Program; Graduate School	MS Sustainable Energy
James Madison University	Public	Department of Integrated Science and Technology; College of Integrated Science and Technology	BS Integrated Science and Technology: Energy
New York Institute of Technology	Private NFP	Department of Energy Management; School of Engineering and Computing Sciences	MS Energy Management
Santa Clara University	Private NFP	Sustainable Energy Program; School of Engineering	MS Sustainable Energy
SUNY Cortland	Public	Department of Physics	PSM Professional Science Master's: Sustainable Energy Systems
University of Michigan-Flint	Public	Department of Earth and Resource Science; College of Arts and Sciences	BS Energy and Sustainable Systems
University of Wisconsin- Platteville	Public	Department of Electrical Engineering; College of Engineering, Mathematics and Science	BS Sustainable and Renewable Energy
Western Illinois University	Public	Interdisciplinary Studies Renewable Energy Program; Honors College	BS Interdisciplinary Studies: Renewable Energy
Western Washington University	Public	Department of Energy Studies; University Interdisciplinary Programs	BA Energy Policy and Management
	Master's Colle	eges and Universities - Smaller Programs	
Green Mountain College	Private NFP	Environmental Studies Program	BA Renewable Energy and Ecological Design
Harrisburg University of Science and Technology	Private NFP	Integrative Sciences: Environmental Science and Renewable Energy Program	BS Integrative Sciences: Environmental Science and Renewable Energy
	Bacca	laureate Colleges - Diverse Fields	
Everelades University	Drivet - NED	Land and Energy Management Decrees	BS Alternative and Renewable Energy Management
Everglades University	Private NFP	Land and Energy Management Program	BS Land and Energy Management
Rogers State University	Public	Department of Technology and Justice Studies; School of Professional Studies	Bachelor of Applied Technology: Renewable Energy Management

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Degree Programs	
Unity College	Private NFP	School of Environmental Citizenship	BS Sustainable Energy Management	
University of Pittsburgh- Bradford	Public Energy Institute		BS Energy Science and Technology	
Baccalaureate/Associate's Colleges - Mixed				
Lake Michigan College	Public	Hanson Technology Center	BS Energy Production and Distribution	

Table D. Energy minor and certificate programs (2016 NCSE Census)

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Minors and Certificates
	Do	octoral Universities - Highest Research Activity	
Arizona State University-Tempe	Public	School of Electrical, Computer and Energy Engineering; Ira A. Fulton Schools of Engineering	GR Certificate: Nuclear Power Generation
Arizona State University-Tempe	Public	School of Sustainability	UG Certificate: Energy and Sustainability
Boston University	Private NFP	Department of Mechanical Engineering; College of Engineering	GR Certificate: Energy and Sustainability
Boston University	Private NFP	Department of Earth and Environment; College of Arts and Sciences	UG Minor: Sustainable Energy
Clemson University	Public	Department of Industrial Engineering; College of Engineering, Computing and Sciences	UG Certificate: Renewable Energy
Cornell University	Private NFP	School of Chemical and Biomolecular Engineering, College of Engineering	UG Minor: Sustainable Energy
Duke University	Private NFP	Gendell Center for Engineering, Energy & the Environment; Nicholas School of the Environment, and Trinity College of Arts and Sciences	UG Certificate: Energy and Environment
Duke University	Private NFP	Energy Engineering Program; Pratt School of Engineering	UG Minor: Energy Engineering
George Mason University	Public	Department of Physics and Astronomy	UG Minor: Renewable Energy
George Washington University	Private NFP	Department of Mechanical and Aerospace Engineering, Department of Engineering Management and Systems Engineering; School of Engineering and Applied Science	GR Certificate: Energy Engineering and Management
George Washington University	Private NFP	Department of Engineering Management and System Engineering; School of Engineering and Applied Science	GR Certificate: Environmental and Energy Systems Management
Georgia Institute of Technology-Main Campus	Public	School of Mechanical Engineering; College of Engineering	UG Minor: Energy Systems
Harvard University	Private NFP	Environmental Science and Public Policy Program; Harvard University Center for the Environment	UG Minor: Energy and Environment
Iowa State University	Public	Engineering - LAS Online Learning; College of Engineering; College of Liberal Arts and Sciences	GR Certificate: Energy Systems Engineering
Massachusetts Institute of Technology	Private NFP	Department of Earth, Atmosphere and Planetary Sciences; School of Science	UG Minor: Energy Studies
Northeastern University	Private NFP	College of Engineering	GR Certificate: Energy Systems Management
Northeastern University	Private NFP	College of Engineering	GR Certificate: Renewable Energy
Northeastern University	Private NFP	College of Engineering	GR Certificate: Energy Systems

Assessing Trends Across Two Pathways To Knowledge Development

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Minors and Certificates	
	Doctoral Universities - Highest Research Activity - continued			
Northeastern University	Private NFP	College of Engineering	GR Certificate: Sustainable Energy Systems	
Northeastern University	Private NFP	College of Engineering	UG Minor: Sustainable Energy Systems	
Northwestern University	Private NFP	Institute for Sustainability and Energy	UG Certificate: Sustainability and Energy	
Pennsylvania State University	Public	Department of Energy and Mineral Engineering; College of Earth and Mineral Sciences	UG Minor: Energy Engineering	
Pennsylvania State University	Public	Department of Energy and Mineral Engineering; College of Earth and Mineral Sciences	UG Minor: Energy Business and Finance	
Pennsylvania State University	Public	Department of Energy and Mineral Engineering; College of Earth and Mineral Sciences	UG Minor: Global Business Strategies For The Earth, Energy, And Materials Industries	
Pennsylvania State University	Public	Department of Energy and Mineral Engineering; College of Earth and Mineral Sciences	GR Minor: Energy And Mineral Engineering	
Pennsylvania State University	Public	Department of Geosciences; College of Earth and Mineral Sciences	UG Minor: Watersheds and Water Resources: Energy Resources	
Princeton University	Private NFP	Program in Sustainable Energy; Andlinger Center for Energy and the Environment and Department of Mechanical and Aerospace Engineering; College of Engineering	UG Certificate: Sustainable Energy	
Purdue University	Public	Department of Mechanical Engineering; College of Engineering	UG Minor: Energy	
Rice University	Private NFP	Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering; Brown School of Engineering	UG Minor: Energy and Water Sustainability	
Stanford University	Private NFP	Department of Energy Resource Engineering; School of Earth, Energy and Environmental Science	GR Minor: Energy Resources Engineering	
Stanford University	Private NFP	Department of Energy Resource Engineering; School of Earth, Energy and Environmental Science	UG Minor: Energy Resources Engineering	
Syracuse University	Private NFP	College of Engineering and Computer Science	UG Minor: Renewable Energy	
Syracuse University	Private NFP	Integrated Learning Majors; College of Arts and Sciences	UG Minor: Energy and its Impacts	
Syracuse University	Private NFP	Department of Mechanical and Aerospace Engineering; College of Engineering and Computer Science	UG Minor: Energy Systems Engineering: Renewable Energy	
Texas A & M University-College Station	Public	Texas A&M Energy Institute	GR Certificate: Energy	
Texas Tech University	Private NFP	National Wind Institute	GR Certificate: Wind Energy (Technical)	
Texas Tech University	Private NFP	National Wind Institute	GR Certificate: Wind Energy (Managerial)	
Texas Tech University	Private NFP	Area of Energy, Economics, and Law; Rawls College of Business	UG Certificate: Energy	

Assessing Trends Across Two Pathways To Knowledge Development

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Minors and Certificates		
	Doctoral Universities - Highest Research Activity - continued				
Texas Tech University	Private NFP	National Wind Institute	UG Certificate: Wind Energy		
Texas Tech University	Private NFP	National Wind Institute	UG Minor: Wind Energy		
The University of Texas-Austin	Public	Texas Executive Education; McCombs School of Business	GR Certificate: Energy		
The University of Texas-Austin	Public	Graduate Portfolio Program in Energy Studies; The Energy Institute	GR Certificate: Energy Studies		
The University of Texas-Austin	Public	Red McCombs School of Business	GR Certificate: Energy Management		
The University of Texas-Austin	Public	Kay Bailey Hutchison Center for Energy, Law, and Business; McComb School of Business	GR Certificate: Global Energy, International Arbitration, and Environmental Law		
Tulane University	Private NFP	School of Law	GR Certificate: Energy and Environmental Law		
University of Arkansas	Public	Great Plains AG*IDEA Consortium (University of Arkansas, Kansas State University, Oklahoma State University and South Dakota State University)	GR Certificate: Bioenergy and Sustainable Technology		
University of California-Berkeley	Public	Engineering Science Program; College of Engineering	UG Minor: Energy Engineering		
University of California, Berkeley	Public	Energy and Resources Group	UG Minor: Energy Resources		
University of California, Berkeley	Public	Environmental and Energy Law Program; College of Law	GR Certificate: Law Specialization in Energy and Clean Tech		
University of California, Berkeley	Public	School of Law	GR Certificate: Program in Energy and Environmental Law		
University of California, Davis	Public	Department of Biological and Agricultural Engineering; College of Agricultural and Environmental Sciences	UG Minor: Energy Science and Technology		
University of California, Davis	Public	Department of Biological and Agricultural Engineering; College of Agricultural and Environmental Sciences	UG Minor: Energy Efficiency		
University of California, Davis	Public	Department of Environmental Science and Policy; College of Agricultural and Environmental Sciences	GR Certificate: Conservation Management: Energy and Transportation Planning		
University of California, Davis	Public	Department of Biological and Agricultural Engineering; College of Agricultural and Environmental Sciences	UG Minor: Energy Policy		
University of Colorado Boulder	Public	Renewable and Sustainable Energy Institute	UG Certificate: Renewable and Sustainable Energy		
University of Colorado Boulder	Public	Renewable and Sustainable Energy Institute	GR Certificate: Renewable and Sustainable Energy		
University of Colorado Boulder	Public	Renewable and Sustainable Energy Institute	Professional Certificate: Renewable and Sustainable Energy		
University of Hawai'i at Manoa	Public	Renewable Energy and Island sustainability	GR Certificate: Renewable Energy and Island Sustainability		

Assessing Trends Across Two Pathways To Knowledge Development

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Minors and Certificates	
Doctoral Universities - Highest Research Activity - continued				
University of Houston	Public	Global Energy Management Program; Department of Finance; Bauer College of Business	UG Certificate: Global Energy Management	
University of Houston	Public	Graduate and Professional Programs; C.T. Bauer College of Business	GR Certificate: Economics of the Energy Value Chain	
University of Houston	Public	The Honors College	UG Minor: Energy and Sustainability	
University of Houston	Public	Graduate and Professional Programs; C.T. Bauer College of Business	GR Certificate: Energy Investment Analysis	
University of Houston	Public	College of Liberal Arts and Social Sciences	GR Certificate: Global Energy, Development, and Sustainability	
University of Houston	Public	Graduate and Professional Programs; C.T. Bauer College of Business	GR Certificate: Energy Finance	
University of Houston	Public	Graduate and Professional Programs; C.T. Bauer College of Business	GR Certificate: Energy Risk Management	
University of Iowa	Public	Department of Mechanical and Industrial Engineering; College of Engineering	UG Certificate: Wind Energy	
University of Kansas	Public	School of Law	GR Certificate: Environmental, Energy and Natural Resources Law	
University of Michigan	Public	Program in the Environment; School of Natural Resources and Environment and the College of Literature, Science, and the Arts	UG Minor: Energy Science and Policy	
University of Nebraska-Lincoln	Public	Nebraska Center for Energy Sciences Research	UG Minor: Energy Science	
University of Nebraska-Lincoln	Public	School of Natural Resources; College of Agricultural Sciences and Natural Resources	UG Minor: Food, Energy and Water in Society	
University of North Texas	Private NFP	Department of Mechanical and Energy Engineering; College of Engineering	GR Certificate: Energy	
University of North Texas	Private NFP	Department of Mechanical and Energy Engineering; College of Engineering	Professional Certificate: Energy Assessment of Buildings	
University of North Texas	Private NFP	Department of Mechanical and Energy Engineering; College of Engineering	GR Minor: Mechanical and Energy Engineering	
University of North Texas	Private NFP	Department of Mechanical and Energy Engineering; College of Engineering	UG Minor: Mechanical and Energy Engineering	
University of Notre Dame	Private NFP	Department of Aerospace and Mechanical Engineering; College of Engineering	UG Minor: Energy Engineering	
University of Notre Dame	Private NFP	Center for Sustainable Energy	UG Minor: Energy Studies	
University of Oklahoma	Public	College of International Studies	UG Minor: Global Energy, Environment, and Resources	
University of Pennsylvania	Private FP	Energy and Sustainability Minor Program; School of Engineering and Applied Science; College of Arts and Sciences	UG Minor: Energy and Sustainability	

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Minors and Certificates	
Doctoral Universities - Highest Research Activity - continued				
University of Pennsylvania	Private FP	Kleinman Center for Energy Policy	GR Certificate: Energy Management and Policy	
University of South Florida	Public	Patel College of Global Sustainability	GR Certificate: Energy Sustainability	
University of Wisconsin-Madison	Public	Wisconsin Energy Institute	UG Certificate: Engineering: Energy Sustainability	
University of Wisconsin-Madison	Public	Nelson Institute for Environmental Studies and the La Follete School of Public Affairs	GR Certificate: Energy Analysis and Policy	
University of Wisconsin-Madison	Public	Nelson Institute for Environmental Studies and the La Follete School of Public Affairs	GR Minor: Energy Analysis and Policy	
University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee	Public	Department of Mechanical Engineering; Graduate School of Engineering	GR Certificate: Energy Engineering	
Washington University in Saint Louis	Private NFP	International Center for Advanced Renewable Energy and Sustainability	UG Certificate: Renewable Energy and the Environment	
Washington University in Saint Louis	Private NFP	Department of Energy, Environmental & Chemical Engineering; School of Engineering & Applied Science	UG Minor: Energy Engineering	
Wayne State University	Public	Alternative Energy Technology Program; College of Engineering	GR Certificate: Alternative Energy Technology	
	D	octoral Universities - Higher Research Activity		
Ball State University	Public	Department of Natural Resources and Environmental Management; College of Sciences and Humanities	UG Minor: Energy	
Colorado School of Mines	Public	Energy Minor Program; Renewable Energy Materials Research Science and Engineering Center	UG Minor: Energy: Renewable Energy	
Illinois Institute of Technology	Private NFP	Environmental and Energy Law JD Program; Chicago- Kent College of Law	GR Certificate: Environmental and Energy Law	
Illinois Institute of Technology	Private NFP	Chemical and Biological Engineering Department; Armour College of Engineering	GR Certificate: Current Energy Issues	
Indiana University- Purdue University- Indianapolis	Public	Department of Mechanical Engineering; Purdue School of Engineering and Technology	GR Certificate: Energy Management and Assessment	
Lehigh University	Private NFP	Department of Mechanical Engineering and Mechanic;, College of Engineering and Applied Science	UG Minor: Energy Engineering	
Mississippi State University	Public	James W. Bagley College of Engineering	UG Certificate: Energy	
New Mexico State University	Public	Department of Engineering Technology and Surveying Engineering; College of Engineering	UG Minor: Renewable Energy Technologies	
Oklahoma State University	Public	Biobased Products and Bioenergy Certificate Program; Biobased Products and Energy Center	GR Certificate: Bioenergy and Sustainable Technology	
Portland State University	Public	Nohad A. Toulan School of Urban Studies and Planning; College of Urban & Public Affairs	GR Certificate: Energy Policy and Management	

Assessing Trends Across Two Pathways To Knowledge Development

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Minors and Certificates		
	Doctoral Universities - Higher Research Activity - continued				
Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute	Private NFP	Interschool Minor in Energy, Science and Technology Studies; School of Humanities, Arts and Social Sciences	UG Minor: Energy		
San Diego State University	Public	Center for Energy Studies	UG Minor: Energy Studies		
South Dakota State University	Public	Department of Agricultural and Biosystems Engineering	GR Certificate: Bioenergy and Sustainable Technology		
Southern Methodist University	Private NFP	Executive Education Programs; Cox School of Business	GR Certificate: Global Enterprise Leadership in the Energy Industry		
Texas Christian University	Private NFP	TCU Energy Institute; College of Science and Engineering and Neeley; School of Business	UG Minor: Energy Technology and Management		
The University of Montana	Public	Energy Technology Program; Department of Applied Computing and Engineering Technology	Professional Certificate of Applied Science: Sustainable Energy Technology		
University of Alaska- Fairbanks	Public	Department of Science; College of Rural and Community Development, Bristol Bay Campus	Professional Certificate: Sustainable Energy		
University of Dayton	Private NFP	Sustainability, Energy and the Environment Initiative	UG Minor: Sustainability, Energy and the Environment		
		Environmental Policy and Management Program;	GR Certificate: Energy and Sustainability		
University of Denver	Private NFP	University College Professional and Continuing Studies	Professional Certificate: Energy and Sustainability		
University of Maine	Public	Renewable Energy Program; College of Engineering and the College of Natural Sciences, Forestry, and Agriculture	UG Minor: Renewable Energy Economics and Policy		
University of Maine	Public	Renewable Energy Program; College of Engineering and the College of Natural Sciences, Forestry, and Agriculture	UG Minor: Renewable Energy Engineering		
University of Maine	Public	Renewable Energy Program; College of Engineering and the College of Natural Sciences, Forestry, and Agriculture	UG Minor: Renewable Energy Science and Technology		
University of Massachusetts Boston	Public	School for the Environment	UG Minor: Clean Energy and Sustainability		
University of Massachusetts Boston	Public	School for the Environment	UG/GR Certificate: Clean Energy and Sustainability		
University of Massachusetts Lowell	Public	Electrical and Computer Engineering Department; Francis College of Engineering	GR Certificate: Energy Conversion		
University of Nevada, Las Vegas	Public	Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering; College of Engineering	UG Minor: Solar and Renewable Energy		
University of Nevada, Las Vegas	Public	Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering; College of Engineering	GR Certificate: Solar and Renewable Energy		

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Minors and Certificates		
	Doctoral Universities - Higher Research Activity - continued				
University of Nevada, Reno	Public	Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering; College of Engineering	UG Minor: Renewable Energy		
University of North Carolina Charlotte	Public	Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering; College of Engineering	UG Minor: Energy Analytics		
University of Toledo	Public	Department of Bioengineering; College of Engineering	UG Minor: Renewable Energy		
University of Tulsa	Private NFP	Energy Management Program; School of Energy Economics, Policy and Commerce; College of Business	UG Minor: Energy Management		
University of Tulsa	Private NFP	College of Law	GR Certificate: Sustainable Energy and Resources Law		
Utah State University	Public	Department of Plants, Soils and Climate; College of Agriculture	UG Minor: Climate Change and Energy		
	Do	ctoral Universities - Moderate Research Activity			
Arizona State University-Downtown Phoenix	Public	School of Community Resources and Development; College of Public Service and Community Solutions	UG Certificate: Energy and Sustainability		
Clarkson University	Private NFP	Clarkson Center for Sustainable Energy Systems	UG Minor: Sustainable Energy Systems Engineering		
Robert Morris University	Private NFP	Department of Science; School of Engineering, Mathematics, and Science	UG Minor: Alternative Energy and Sustainability		
SUNY College of Environmental Science and Forestry	Public	Department of Environmental Resource Engineering	UG Minor: Renewable Energy		
University of Louisiana at Monroe	Public	Biofuel Production Operations Program; Sustainable Energy and Going Green Programs; Division of Continuing Education	Professional Certificate: Biofuel Production Operations		
University of Louisiana at Monroe	Public	Wind Energy Professional Program; Sustainable Energy and Going Green Programs; Division of Continuing Education	Professional Certificate: Wind Energy Professional		
University of Louisiana at Monroe	Public	Solar Power Professional Program; Sustainable Energy and Going Green Programs; Division of Continuing Education	Professional Certificate: Solar Power Professional		
Wright State University	Public	Department of Mechanical and Materials Engineering; College of Engineering and Computer Science	UG Minor Engineering: Renewable and Clean Energy		
Master's Colleges and Universities - Larger Programs					
Arkansas State University - Jonesboro	Public	College of Agriculture and Technology	UG Minor: Renewable Energy Technology		
California State Polytechnic University, Pomona	Public	College of Engineering	UG Minor: Energy Engineering		
Central Washington University	Public	Geography Department; College of the Sciences	UG Minor: Energy Studies		

Assessing Trends Across Two Pathways To Knowledge Development

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Minors and Certificates	
Master's Colleges and Universities - Larger Programs - continued				
Citadel Military College of South Carolina	Public	Department of Mechanical Engineering; School of Engineering	GR Certificate: Power and Energy	
Creighton University	Private NFP	Energy Technology Program; College of Arts and Sciences	UG Minor: Sustainable Energy Science	
Lawrence Technological University	Private NFP	Department of Mechanical Engineering; College of Engineering	GR Certificate: Energy Engineering	
Lawrence Technological University	Private NFP	Department of Mechanical Engineering; College of Engineering	UG Minor: Energy Engineering	
New York Institute of Technology-Old Westbury	Private NFP	Department of Energy Management; School of Engineering and Computing Sciences	GR Certificate: Energy Technology	
New York Institute of Technology-Old Westbury	Private NFP	Department of Energy Management; School of Engineering and Computing Sciences	UG Minor: Energy Science, Technology and Policy	
Saint Francis University	Private NFP	School of Business	Professional Certificate: Renewable Energy	
San Jose State University	Public	Environmental Studies Department; College of Social Sciences	UG Minor: Energy Policy and Green Building	
Santa Clara University	Private NFP	Sustainable Energy Program; School of Engineering	GR Certificate: Renewable Energy	
St Mary's University	Private NFP	Department of Physics and Earth Sciences; School of Science, Engineering and Technology	UG Minor: Energy Science and Technology	
St Mary's University	Private NFP	Department of Physics and Earth Sciences; School of Science, Engineering and Technology	UG Minor: Energy Science and Policy	
SUNY-Buffalo	Public	Department of Engineering Technology	UG Minor: Energy Systems	
The University of Tennessee-Chattanooga	Public	College of Engineering and Computer Science	Professional Certificate: Electrical Engineering Smart Grid	
The University of Tennessee-Chattanooga	Public	College of Engineering and Computer Science	Professional Certificate: Electrical Engineering Smart Power Distribution	
The University of Tennessee-Chattanooga	Public	College of Engineering and Computer Science	Professional Certificate: Engineering Management Power Systems Management	
The University of Tennessee-Chattanooga	Public	College of Engineering and Computer Science	Professional Certificate: Sustainable Electric Energy Certificate	
University of Alaska- Anchorage	Public	Community and Technical College	UG Certificate: Sustainable Energy	
University of Detroit Mercy	Private NFP	Interdisciplinary Engineering Graduate Programs; College of Engineering and Science	UG Certificate: Advanced Electric Vehicles	

Assessing Trends Across Two Pathways To Knowledge Development

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Minors and Certificates	
Master's Colleges and Universities - Larger Programs - continued				
University of Minnesota-Duluth	Public	Department of Electrical Engineering; Swenson College of Science and Engineering	UG Minor: Energy Engineering	
University of Southern Maine	Public	Department of Environmental Science; School of Environmental, Health, and Life Sciences, College of Science, Technology, and Health	UG Minor: Applied Energy	
University of Southern Maine	Public	Department of Environmental Science; School of Environmental, Health, and Life Sciences; College of Science, Technology, and Health	UG Certificate: Applied Energy	
University of Wisconsin-Platteville	Public	Department of Electrical Engineering; College of Engineering, Mathematics and Science	UG Minor: Renewable Energy	
Western Washington University	Public	Department of Energy Studies; University Interdisciplinary Programs	UG Minor: Energy Policy	
Western Washington University	Public	Department of Energy Studies, University Interdisciplinary Programs	UG Minor: Energy Science	
	Mast	er's Colleges and Universities - Medium Programs		
Arizona State University- Polytechnic	Public	School of Community Resources and Development; College of Public Service and Community Solutions	UG Certificate: Energy and Sustainability	
Franklin Pierce University	Private NFP	College of Graduate and Professional Studies	GR Certificate: Energy and Sustainability Studies	
John Brown University	Private NFP	Department of Renewable Energy; Division of Engineering and Construction Management	UG Minor: Renewable Energy	
			GR Certificate: Sustainable Energy Technician	
Montana State University-Billings	Public	Department of Industry; City College at MSU Billings	Professional Certificate: Sustainable Energy Technician	
			UG Certificate: Sustainable Energy Technician	
Northern Michigan University	Public	Department of Engineering Technology; School of Technology and Applied Sciences	UG Minor: Alternative Energy	
The University of Texas of the Permian Basin	Public	Department of Physical Sciences, College of Arts and Sciences	UG Minor: Energy Studies	
University of Alaska- Southeast	Public	Department of Construction Technology; School of Career Education	Professional Certificate: Building Energy Retrofit Technician (Occupational Endorsement)	
	Master's	Colleges and Universities - Smaller Programs N =	9	
Eastern Connecticut State University	Public	Department of Environmental Earth Science	UG Minor: Sustainable Energy Studies	
Green Mountain College	Private NFP	Environmental Studies Program	UG Certificate: Renewable Energy and Ecological Design Certificate	

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Minors and Certificates		
	Master's Colleges and Universities - Smaller Programs N = 9 - continued				
SUNY-Oneonta	Public	Department of Earth and Atmospheric Sciences; School of Natural and mathematical Sciences	UG Minor: Energy		
University of Hawaii- Hilo	Public	Energy Science Certificate Program	UG Certificate: Energy Science Certificate		
University of Houston-Downtown	Public	Department of Management, Marketing and Business; College of Business	UG Minor: Energy Management		
University of Wisconsin- Stevens Point	Public	Human Dimensions of Natural Resource Management Discipline; College of Natural Resources	GR Certificate: Energy Education		
University of Wisconsin- Stevens Point	Public	Human Dimensions of Natural Resource Management Discipline; College of Natural Resources	UG Minor: Sustainable Energy		
University of Wisconsin- Stevens Point	Public	Department of Paper Science and Engineering	UG Minor: Biofuels Engineering		
University of Wisconsin- Stevens Point	Public	Human Dimensions of Natural Resource Management Discipline; College of Natural Resources	UG Certificate: Sustainable Energy		
		Baccalaureate Colleges - Arts and Sciences			
Alfred University	Private NFP	Renewable Energy Engineering Program, Inamori School of Engineering	UG Minor: Renewable Energy Engineering		
Lewis and Clark College	Private NFP	Environmental and Natural Resources Law Program; Law School	GR Certificate: Environmental, Natural Resources, and Energy Law		
Pennsylvania State University-Berks	Public	Energy Systems Certificate program, Electrical Engineering Technology; Division of Engineering, Business, and Computing	GR Certificate: Energy Systems		
Union College- Schenectady	Private NFP	Energy Studies program minor, Department of Mechanical Engineering; College of Engineering	UG Minor: Energy Studies		
		Baccalaureate Colleges - Diverse Fields			
Embry-Riddle Aeronautical University-Prescott	Private NFP	College of Arts and Sciences	UG Minor: Alternative Energy		
Marietta College	Private NFP	Department of Petroleum Engineering and Geology	UG Minor: Energy System Studies		
Marietta College	Private NFP	Department of Petroleum Engineering and Geology	UG Minor: Energy System Engineering		
Montana Tech of the University of Montana	Public	Trades and Technical Department	Professional Certificate of Applied Science: Energy Technology - Wind		
Oklahoma Baptist University	Private NFP	Paul Dickinson College of Business; Graduate College	GR Certificate: Energy and Land Management		
Oklahoma Baptist University	Private NFP	Paul Dickinson College of Business; Graduate College	GR Certificate: Energy Management		
University of Maine- Presque Isle	Public	Environmental Science and Sustainability Program; College of Arts and Sciences	UG Certificate: Environmental Science, Energy and Climate Change		

Institution	Control	Academic Unit	Minors and Certificates
		Baccalaureate/Associate's Colleges - Mixed	
Bismarck State College	Public	Energy Program	UG Certificate: Energy Services and Renewable Technician
Lake Michigan College	Public	Energy Production Line Worker Program	UG Certificate: Energy Production Line Worker
Madison Area Technical College	Public	School of Applied Science, Engineering and Technology	UG Certificate: Wind Energy Technology
North Seattle College	Public	Sustainability Department	UG Certificate: Sustainable and Conventional Energy and Control Technology
Oklahoma State University	Public	Division of Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics	UG Certificate: Renewable and Sustainable Energy
Special Business/Law			
Pinchot University	Private NFP	Dean's Office	GR Certificate: Sustainable Energy Solutions
Vermont Law School	Private NFP	Certificate in Energy Law Program	GR Certificate: Energy Law